

No. S218497

In the Supreme Court of the State of California

---

**CENTINELA FREEMAN EMERGENCY MEDICAL ASSOCIATES,  
ET AL.**

Plaintiffs, Appellants, and Respondents

vs.

**HEALTH NET OF CALIFORNIA, INC., ET AL.,**  
Defendants, Respondents, and Petitioners

---

**NOTICE OF ERRATA FOR AMICUS CURIAE BRIEF OF THE  
CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF MANAGED HEALTH  
CARE IN RESPONSE TO THE COURT'S INVITATION**

---

After an Opinion By The Court of Appeal  
Second Appellate District, Division Three, No. B238867

Appeal from a Judgment of the Los Angeles County  
Superior Court Case No. BC415203, Hon. John Shepard Wiley

RECEIVED

MAR 21 2016

CLERK SUPREME COURT

---

*Service on the Attorney General and the Los Angeles District  
Attorney Required by Bus. & Prof. Code § 17209 and California Rules of  
Court*

*Rule 8.29(a) and (b)*

---

**CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF MANAGED HEALTH CARE  
CAROL L. VENTURA, Deputy Director | Chief Counsel, SBN 99570  
DREW BRERETON, Assistant Chief Counsel, SBN 213277**

**\* SHEILA M. TATAYON, Attorney IV, SBN 149401**

980 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 500

Sacramento, CA 95814-2725

916-323-0435; 916-323-0438(fax)

Attorneys for Amicus Curiae the Department of Managed Health Care

TO THE COURT, EACH PARTY, AMICI CURIAE, AND COUNSEL OF RECORD FOR THE PARTIES AND AMICI CURIAE:

Please take notice that the California Department of Managed Health Care's Amicus Curiae Brief filed on March 18, 2016, contains an error. On page 18, the word "NOT" was inadvertently deleted from the heading. **Section III, subsection A.**, should be revised to include the word "NOT" as follows: **"The Financial Failure of La Vida Provides Valuable Lessons but Does Not Counsel Recognizing a Tort Cause of Action for Negligent Delegation."** Please further note that the Table of Contents, page iii, contains this same error and should be revised as noted. A corrected page iii and a corrected page 18 are attached.

Dated: March 21, 2016

CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF MANAGED HEALTH CARE  
OFFICE OF ENFORCEMENT

CAROL L. VENTURA  
Deputy Director | Chief Counsel

DREW BRERETON  
Assistant Chief Counsel

By:   
SHEILA M. TATAYON  
Attorney IV

Attorneys for Amicus Curiae  
California Department of Managed Health Care

III.	Recognizing the New Torts Could Harm the Delegated Model and the Consumers.....	17
A.	The Financial Failure of La Vida Provides Valuable Lessons but Does Not Counsel Recognizing a Tort Cause of Action for Negligent Delegation.....	18
B.	RBO Failures Were Infrequent in the Past and, With Revisions to the Statutory and Regulatory Framework Since the Late 1990s, Should be Less Frequent in the Future.....	22
C.	A Tort Cause of Action for Negligent Delegation is Likely to Discourage Delegation and Negatively Impact Consumers.....	25
	<b>CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>26</b>
	<b>CERTIFICATION OF WORD COUNT .....</b>	<b>29</b>

An RBO failure and consequent reassignment of patients are not a desirable outcome for any of the parties involved. It is far preferable when an RBO can be rehabilitated, if there is a viable means to do so. With foremost consideration for the health plan members' interests, the DMHC encourages health plans to be mindful of their obligations to their members and discourages health plans from terminating risk arrangements with RBOs when rehabilitation appears possible. The DMHC's actions relative to La Vida were guided by this principle.

**A. The Financial Failure of La Vida Provides Valuable Lessons but Does Not Counsel Recognizing a Tort Cause of Action for Negligent Delegation**

In La Vida's case, the CAP approval process ultimately failed. But La Vida, with its unusual circumstances, does not necessarily lead to the conclusion that recognition of new tort causes of action for negligent delegation or negligent continuation of delegation is generally warranted.

The circumstances of La Vida and the magnitude of its financial failure are rare. According to the facts alleged in Centinela's complaint, beginning in 2007 and continuing quarterly thereafter, La Vida failed to comply with several of the DMHC financial Grading Criteria; and the Health Plans were aware of La Vida's worsening financial condition.<sup>9</sup> While La Vida was clearly experiencing financial problems at various times

---

<sup>9</sup> Appellants' (Centinela) Complaint, page 10, paragraphs 48 – 49 (1 AA 41.).

**PROOF OF SERVICE**

I am employed in the County of Sacramento, State of California. I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the within action. My business address is 980 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 500, Sacramento, California 95814. On March 21, 2016, I served the foregoing document described as:

**NOTICE OF ERRATA FOR AMICUS CURIAE BRIEF OF THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF MANAGED HEALTH CARE IN RESPONSE TO THE COURT'S INVITATION**

on all persons named on the attached list, by the method of service indicated, as follows:


**BY PERSONAL SERVICE** at the business or residential address(es) listed below.

If **U.S. MAIL** is indicated, by placing a true copy thereof enclosed in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the United States mail at Sacramento, California, and addressed to the person(s) at the address(es) listed above. I am readily familiar with the Department's business practice for collection and processing for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service pursuant to which practice the correspondence will be deposited with the U.S. Postal Service this same day in the ordinary course of business.

If **E-MAIL SERVICE** is indicated, based on a court order or an agreement of the parties to accept service, I caused the documents to be sent to the person(s) at the electronic service address listed below. If served by electronic service, the electronic service address from which I served the document is roderick.tagatac@dmhc.ca.gov.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above is true and correct.

Executed on March 21, 2016, at Sacramento, California.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
ROD TAGATAC

<p>Attorneys for  Plaintiffs/Appellants, <i>Centinela  Freeman Emergency Medical  Associates; Sherman Oaks  Emergency Medical Associates;  Valley Presbyterian Emergency  Medical Associates; Westside  Emergency Medical Associates;  Centinela Radiology Medical  Group</i>  <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>Andrew H. Selesnick, Esq.  Damaris L. Medina, Esq.  Robin James, Esq.  <b>Michelman &amp; Robinson LLP</b>  10880 Wilshire Boulevard, 19<sup>th</sup> Floor  Los Angeles, CA 90024  Telephone: (310) 564-2670  Facsimile: (310) 564-2671  aselesnick@mrlip.com  dmedina@mrlip.com  rjames@mrlip.com</p>
<p>Attorneys for  Defendant/Respondent  <i>Health Net of California, Inc.</i>  <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>William A. Helvestine, Esq.  David Johnson, Esq.  <b>Crowell &amp; Moring LLP</b>  275 Battery Street, 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor  San Francisco, CA 94111  Telephone: (415) 986-2800  Facsimile: (415) 986-2827  whelvestine@crowell.com  davidjohnson@crowell.com</p>
<p>Attorney for  Defendant/Respondent  <i>Pacificare of California dba  Secure Horizons Health Plan of  America</i>  <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>Jennifer S. Romano, Esq.  <b>Crowell &amp; Moring LLP</b>  515 S. Flower Street, 40<sup>th</sup> Floor  Los Angeles, CA 90071  Telephone: (213) 622-4750  Facsimile: (213) 622-2690  jromano@crowell.com</p>
<p>Attorneys for  Defendant/Respondent  <i>Aetna Health of California, Inc.</i>  <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>Richard J. Doren, Esq.  Heather L. Richardson, Esq.  <b>Gibson, Dunn &amp; Crutcher LLP</b>  333 South Grand Avenue  Los Angeles, CA 90071-3197  Telephone: (213) 229-7000  Facsimile: (213) 229-7520  rdoren@gibsondunn.com  hrichardson@gibsondunn.com</p>

<p>Attorneys for Defendant/Respondent <i>California Physicians' Service dba Blue Shield of California</i> <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>Joanna McCallum, Esq. Gregory N. Pimstone, Esq. Jeffrey J. Maurer, Esq. <b>Manatt, Phelps &amp; Phillips LLP</b> 11355 West Olympic Boulevard Los Angeles, CA 90064 Telephone: (310) 312-4000 Facsimile: (310) 312-4224 jmccallum@manatt.com gpimstone@manatt.com jmaurer@manatt.com pwalker@manatt.com</p>
<p>Attorneys for Defendant/Respondent <i>Cigna Healthcare of California, Inc.</i> <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>William P. Donovan, Jr., Esq. Matthew D. Caplan, Esq. <b>Cooley LLP</b> 1333 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, Suite 400 Santa Monica, CA 90401 Telephone: (310) 883-6400 Facsimile: (310) 883-6500 wdonovan@cooley.com mcaplan@cooley.com</p>
<p>Attorneys for Amicus Curiae <i>California Association of Health Plans and CAPG</i> <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>John M. LeBlanc, Esq. Larry M. Golub, Esq. Sandra I. Weishart, Esq. <b>Hinshaw &amp; Culbertson LLP</b> 633 W. 5<sup>th</sup> Street, 47<sup>th</sup> Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071 Telephone: (213) 680-2800 Facsimile: (213) 614-7399 sweishart@mail.hinshawlaw.com</p>
<p>Attorneys for Defendant/Respondent <i>Blue Cross of California dba Anthem Blue Cross</i> <b>Via E-Mail</b></p>	<p>Kurt C. Peterson, Esq. Kenneth N. Smersfelt, Esq. Zareh Jaltorossian, Esq. <b>Reed Smith LLP</b> 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 2900 Los Angeles, CA 90072 Telephone: (213) 457-8000 Facsimile: (213) 457-8080 kpeterson@reedsmith.com ksmersfelt@reedsmith.com zjaltorossian@reedsmith.com</p>

<p>Attorney for Defendant/Respondent <i>Blue Cross of California dba Anthem Blue Cross</i> <b>Via E-Mail and U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Margaret M. Grignon <b>Grignon Law Firm</b> 5150 E. Pacific Coast Highway, Suite 200 Long Beach, CA 90804 Telephone: (562) 285-3171 mgrignon@grignonlawfirm.com</p>
<p>Attorneys for Defendant/Respondent <i>Scan Health Plan</i> <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Don A. Hernandez, Esq. Jamie L. Lopez, Esq. <b>Gonzalez Saggio &amp; Harlan LLP</b> 2 N. Lake Avenue, Suite 930 Pasadena, CA 91101</p>
<p>Attorney for Amicus Curiae for Appellant <i>California Chapter of the American College of Emergency Physicians</i> <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Astrid G. Meghrigian 715 Scott Street San Francisco, CA 94117</p>
<p>Attorneys for Amicus Curiae <i>California Medical Association; California Hospital Association; California Orthopedic Association; California Radiological Society; California Society of Pathologists</i> <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Long Xuan Do Francisco Javier Silva Michelle Rubalcava <b>California Medical Association (CMA)</b> 1201 J Street, Suite 200 Sacramento, CA 95814</p>
<p>Case No. B238867 <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Court of Appeal Second Appellate District, Division Three 300 South Spring Street Second Floor, North Tower Los Angeles, CA 90013-1213</p>
<p>Served pursuant to Bus. &amp; Prof. Code, § 17209 and Cal. Rules of Court 8.29(a) and (b) <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Appellate Coordinator Office of the Attorney General Consumer Law Section 300 South Spring Street Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 974-3512</p>



<p>Served pursuant to Bus. &amp; Prof. Code, § 17209 and Cal. Rules of Court 8.29(a) and (b)  <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Consumer Law Section  Los Angeles District Attorney  210 West Temple Street, Suite 1800  Los Angeles, CA 90012-3210  Telephone: (213) 974-3512</p>
<p>Case No. BC415203  <b>Via U.S. Mail</b></p>	<p>Los Angeles Superior Court  Central Civil West Courthouse  Honorable John Shepard Wiley, Jr.  Department 311  600 S. Commonwealth Avenue  Los Angeles, CA 90005</p>
<p>California Supreme Court  <b>Via Personal Service</b></p>	<p>Supreme Court of California  Office of the Clerk, First Floor  350 McAllister Street  San Francisco, CA 94102-4797</p>